

**Report of a Member of the Thesis Council on the Thesis of Ekaterina Kologermanskaia on the theme “Legal aspects of renewable energy sources’ use in the Russian Federation and Foreign Countries”**

Submitted in conformity with Requirements for the Candidate degree of Legal Sciences, Specialty 12.00.07 – Corporate law; competition law; energy law

I have read the English translation of Ms Kologermanskaia’s thesis “Legal aspects of renewable energy sources’ use in the Russian Federation and Foreign Countries” and these are my observations and conclusions regarding the academic quality of the Thesis.

Every thesis has stronger and weaker aspects. My role as an examiner is to focus on the weaker parts of the thesis. As such, my brief remarks are mainly focused on issues that could have been improved. In addition to these parts, the thesis contains other sections and arguments that do not cause any questions or criticism.

The structure of the thesis is simple and works well. Chapter 1 focuses on subject and sources of law of renewable energy use in Russia. Chapter 2 examines the contractual regulation of relations arising from the use of renewables sources and chapter three provides for a comparative overview of selected foreign jurisdictions. There is a separate conclusion for the thesis.

The first chapter of thesis focusing on subject and sources of law of renewable energy use in Russia is somewhat descriptive in the sense that it goes through details of the Russian legislation without much discussion on the topics and issues raised. While there is a degree of the discussion but much of the first chapter of the thesis covers and repeats existing law. However, while this makes the thesis descriptive, it also appears to be one of the strengths of this thesis. It goes into considerable depth in analysing the existing law. What would have made this aspect even stronger, is more detailed commentary on the relative strength and weaknesses of the legal regime on Russia. I

would have been very interested in the qualification of gas generated in coal mining. It does not appear to be “renewable energy” but the federal law seems to qualify it as renewable.

Comparative law is a difficult topic for any academic or legal expert. The comparative parts of chapter one of this thesis are somewhat brief and descriptive. They appear to rely on limited sources. The author would have benefitted greatly from the 2018 book from Penelope Crossley “Renewable energy law” published by Cambridge University Press. This book fills the gap correctly identified in the thesis that “definition of renewable energy has not been given sufficient attention”. Dr Crossley’s research on that specific topic covers all existing national regulatory frameworks for renewable energy. The quality of the comparative parts of thesis are better in the subsequent chapters, but remain somewhat descriptive.

The second chapter focuses on the contractual regulation of relations arising from the use of renewable energy sources. Much like the first chapter, this chapter contain several long lists describing various issues and questions. From the readers perspective, these list are not perhaps the best way of describing things. They do not read well and give the appearance of being rather superficial and descriptive. However, the data contained in these lists appear to be correct and clear.

Chapter three focuses describing the regulatory regimes in certain other jurisdictions, EU, Switzerland, Canada and Iceland. This chapter would have benefitted from more detailed research in various jurisdictions. It currently remains somewhat superficial, like such comparisons often are. In particular, the academic commentaries on various national systems examined in the thesis would have made the comparative parts stronger.

The conclusion could benefit from a more detailed discussion. While the preceding chapters are very (perhaps too) detailed, the conclusion is very brief and general. This happens quite often with thesis, the author has the energy to study and examine the subject in detail but gets tired of the topic when it comes to the conclusion. As such, the conclusion falls short of what would have been expected when reading the thesis itself.

However, despite these critical remarks, the thesis is clearly completed and independently executed scientific research. It creates new knowledge that should be of interest to the future scholars and policy makers in the area of renewable energy in Russia and beyond. The thesis meets the requirements for a thesis and Ekaterina Kologermanskaia should be awarded the Candidate degree of Legal Sciences in the Specialty 12.00.07 – Corporate law; competition law; energy law.

14.10.2020, Joensuu, Finland

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Kim Talus', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Kim Talus

Professor of European Economic and Energy Law

UEF Law School

University of Eastern Finland