



20 October 2020

**Raphael J Heffron**

BA, MA, MLitt, MPhil, MSc, PhD, Barrister-at-Law

Professor in Global Energy Law & Sustainability

Centre for Energy, Petroleum and Mineral Law and Policy, University of Dundee, UK

Report of the member of Thesis Council on the thesis

**‘Legal Aspects of the Renewable Energy Sources’ Use in the Russian Federation and Foreign  
Countries’**

submitted for the Degree of Candidate in Legal Sciences,

Major – 12.00.07 Corporate law; competition law; energy law

By Kologermanskaia Ekaterina Mikhailovna

at Kutafin Moscow State Law University

Report Submission for

Kologermanskaia Ekaterina Mikhailovna

**‘Legal Aspects of the Renewable Energy Sources’ Use in the Russian Federation and Foreign  
Countries’**

From

Professor Raphael J Heffron

BA, MA, MLitt, MPhil, MSc, PhD, Barrister-at-Law

Centre for Energy, Petroleum and Mineral Law and Policy, University of Dundee, UK



## **(1) Outline**

Overall, the thesis covers an important topic. The dissertation is on topic of '*Legal Aspects of the Renewable Energy Sources' Use in the Russian Federation and Foreign Countries*'. Renewable energy can play a vital role in the production of electricity and therefore in the development of a low-carbon economy.

It is clear in the dissertation that the author has a clear and significant knowledge of the subject area. It is a clear and extensive review of Renewable Energy Legislation within Russia and also internationally. Stylistically and in terms of presentation there can be minor improvements (detailed below), but generally the structure, content and presentation is clear.

**Note:** I refer to Kologermanskaia Ekaterina Mikhailovna as the 'author' throughout this report.

## **(2) Assessment**

### ***Relevance of the topic of the dissertation research***

The topic of this dissertation is highly relevant to the energy sector in today's modern world. All across the world there are ambitions to grow renewable energy as a source and in order for that to happen law has to be put in place to ensure that it happens and is incentivised. New law was needed to focus specifically on renewable energy to ensure that it as a technology source is developed. Many countries see the opportunity to meet their growing energy demands and also to diversify their energy mix. This dissertation identifies the key range of issues that need to change within Russian energy law so as to accommodate the development of renewable energy. Further, there is the additional contribution of a comparative legal analysis of foreign countries and their actions in developing renewable energy and the necessary legislation.



The comparative analysis which includes the following countries, Iceland, Canada, Switzerland and the European Union contributes an original comparative analysis to the literature, and the author should be commended for this vision.

***Degree of validity of scientific provisions, conclusions and recommendations formulated in the Dissertation***

The conclusions of the thesis are clear and supported by the analysis. The review of the range of issues needed to develop the renewable energy sector in Russia is a commendable aim. The author accomplishes this by assessing the range of public and private law and exploring the link between energy and electricity policy. Further, there is significant doctrinal research and the additional comparative legal research that further supports the research objectives in this thesis. This adds the robustness and ensures the validity of the scientific provision and conclusions.

There are a number of minor recommendations stated later in the report that could be completed. These that focus on addition references and analysis would add additional and further validity to the research. The research is vital to the development of a renewable energy sector and as such there is additional value in the research beyond just academia.

***Structure and content of the dissertation***

The Table of Contents clearly sets out the dissertation and its structure. The content is well-balanced and covers the key issues. There are two minor issues which I have identified further below and they include a greater expansion in the conclusion and also the identification of the comparative analysis in Chapter 3 and its value within the introduction but particularly the conclusion.



### **(3) Specific Areas of Discussion**

#### **Introduction**

The literature assessed and its diversity is very good. The author identified clearly the different classes in terms of the literature and was able to highlight literature within the context of the discussions outlined above. Overall the dissertation expresses clearly its contribution and provides a systematic analysis of renewable energy legislation and its gaps within Russia.

#### **Main Body**

The thesis offers a potentially significant contribution to learning through the assessment renewable energy and the key issues in terms of its development within Russia. I believe the student to have demonstrated clear and good understanding of the topic. For me there were two issues of clarity needed here.

The first issue is that I believe the contributions of Chapter 3 need to be more expressed more clearly and aligned with the Introduction and Conclusion. There should be reflection on what is the value of the different analysis on the range of international countries.

My belief is that the candidate has chosen a challenging research topic and was forced to confront a range of different issues as they progressed deeper into the topic. Nevertheless, I believe there are a number of additions that could be made to the work and these are identified below:

- (1) this paper analyses energy law from a historical perspective, and the author could state at what point renewable energy development relates to, i.e. such as infrastructure and justice. Link 1: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2214629616301001>



(2) the second paper is by a group of different energy law academics from across the world and is focused on thinking about energy law and its theory - it identifies Principles of Energy Law – and it would be interesting to see some reflection how renewable energy development meets many of these seven principles.

Link 2: <https://academic.oup.com/jwelb/article/11/1/34/4792991?searchresult=1>

(3) Thirdly, there is a recent range of papers on Energy Law in a special issue in a leading interdisciplinary journal – Energy Policy – a scroll down through the papers published (there are 25 published) may also help the author place their work in context with more than several exploring issues on renewable energy law.

Link 3: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/journal/energy-policy/special-issue/10J7XHDCD55>

## **Conclusion**

Finally, the conclusion needs to highlight further the contributions of the dissertation – which literature has your analysis built on, and how. Further additions are needed on explaining the contributions from Chapter 3.

Additionally, the conclusion is perhaps too brief and could be extended in three ways. Firstly, the discussion on the contributions could be further extended. Second, the author should identify some limitations within the thesis. Finally, there should be an analysis on future areas of interest in terms of the research.

## **References/ Footnotes**

The author should be commended for a comprehensive reference list. Nevertheless, the author would benefit from the addition of more additional foreign literature on renewable energy law specifically. There are books etc, mentioned but as suggested earlier, I would also encourage the use of articles too such as from [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com).



I think the internet referenced footnotes could be improved. For example, see the OSCOLA (Oxford University) approach where the Organization and title of the article etc. is included alongside the *date of last access*; and that will protect the author should that article be deleted later.

#### (4) Overall Preliminary View

Overall, this is an excellent dissertation completed by Kologermanskaia Ekaterina Mikhailovna on '*Legal Aspects of the Renewable Energy Sources' Use in the Russian Federation and Foreign Countries*'. It looks to international development in terms of renewable energy law and explores the lessons for the Russian energy sector. It is evident that the thesis makes new contributions in the area and illuminates key issues in the context of the gaps in Russian Energy Law on renewable energy law. Overall, the author offers a novel and original research perspective on renewable energy legislative development in Russia.

Therefore, this dissertation research completed by Kologermanskaia Ekaterina Mikhailovna on the '*Legal Aspects of the Renewable Energy Sources' Use in the Russian Federation and Foreign Countries*' and presented for the Degree of Candidate in Legal Sciences meets the requirements for candidates with a speciality in the following area: Major – 12.00.07 Corporate law; competition law; energy law.

20 October 2020

Raphael J Heffron BA, MA, MLitt, MPhil, MSc, PhD, Barrister-at-Law

[Professor in Global Energy Law & Sustainability](#) & Jean Monnet Professor in the Just Transition to a Low-Carbon Economy

Centre for Energy, Petroleum and Mineral Law and Policy, University of Dundee, UK

Senior Fellow of the UK Higher Education Academy – Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts – Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh's Young Academy of Scotland

UK Energy Research Centre Research Associate - Visiting Lecturer at the ESCP Business School (London and Paris) - Visiting Professor Université Paris-Dauphine (France), Queen Mary University of London, Eduardo Mondlane University (Mozambique) and Associate Researcher, Energy Policy Research Group, University of Cambridge (UK)